

## **Why do Traditionalist feel that they need to leave the UMC instead of Progressives?**

Author: Mary Sansing

- Traditionalist have the majority at General Conference, have won all of the votes regarding homosexuality policies in the UMC and feel that they are keeping their ordination vows and living in accordance with the regulations of the UMC Book of Discipline. So why do they feel that **they** need to leave the UMC? **(1)**
- After the 2019 Special General Conference at which the Traditional Plan was passed, many Progressive Churches began making plans to disaffiliate. However, a statement by California–Nevada Conference Bishop Carcaño and others persuaded many Centrists/Progressives to remain in the UMC. **(2)**  
Note: The Traditional Plan enhanced current policies in the Book of Discipline (BOD) about homosexuality and strengthened enforcement. **(5)**
- Traditionalists were left with two choices:
  1. Stay in the UMC and escalate the fight with secular lawsuits, attempts to punish Progressive bishops and clergy for ignoring the Book of Discipline & the Judicial Council rulings, and continue public bickering over the Book of Discipline regulations. OR
  2. Leave the UMC to avoid the escalating conflict (& its horrible witness to the world) and to concentrate on the mission & ministry of the church. **(1)**
- A small, but increasing number of churches have chosen to or are considering leaving the UMC. In 2020 and 2021, approximately 130 of the more than 30,000 Methodist churches in the US disaffiliated. In the first six months of 2022, 300 churches applied & were approved for disaffiliation by their Annual Conferences and many more are in the process of discerning whether or not to leave. **(3)**
- Why are Traditional churches not waiting to leave until the 2024 General Conference in hopes that the Protocol will be passed and allow for a more favorable and less expensive means of exit?  
A number of Centrist/Progressive negotiators of the Protocol have made a statement that they no longer feel the Protocol is valid and have withdrawn their support for it. **(6)** In addition, non-US leaders in the UMC have serious reservations about the document and their support is questionable. **(6)** As time goes on and the 2020 General Conference is repeatedly delayed, the Protocol's chances of passage keep declining. Currently the only approved path of disaffiliation allowing churches to keep their property is through Paragraph 2553 of the BOD. This is a temporary provision & expires 12/31/23. **(4)** There is concern that either no path to disaffiliation or a much more onerous path will be passed at the 2024 General Conference. Many Traditional churches suspect that if they want to disaffiliate, it's now or never.

- **1. Daniel Hixon, YouTube discussion, “Why are Traditionalist leaving, not Progressives?” May 18, 2022.**  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=vYQjiOxme0s>
- **2. UMNews.org, “California-Nevada says no to withholding funds, disaffiliation”, July 3, 2019.**  
<https://www.umnews.org/en/news/california-nevada-says-no-to-withholding-funds-disaffiliation>
- **3. UMNews.org, “ Conferences diverge in handling church exits”, July 15, 2022** <https://www.umnews.org/en/news/conferences-diverge-in-handling-church-exits> and [umnews.org “Church disaffiliations, court cases mount”, February 8, 2022.](https://www.umnews.org/en/news/church-disaffiliations-court-cases-mount) <https://www.umnews.org/en/news/church-disaffiliations-court-cases-mount>
- **4. UM\_insight.net “The Centrist/Progressive message to Traditionalists and Institutionalists”, June 22, 2022 by David Scott.** <https://um-insight.net/in-the-church/umc-future/the-centristprogressive-message-to-traditionalists-and-insti/>
- **5. UMC.org “What did the Judicial Council Decide about the Traditional Plan?”** <https://www.umc.org/en/content/ask-the-umc-what-did-the-judicial-council-decide-about-the-traditional-plan>
- **6. UMNews.org “Protocol’s day has passed, some negotiators say”**  
<https://www.umnews.org/en/news/protocols-day-has-passed-some-negotiators-say>